

After scrutinizing the record shots that were obtained on site, we conclude the following: This bird has, prior to its spring migration, renewed a few tertials and greater coverts whereas the rest of the plumage is very worn. This appearance indicates the second calendar year. Northern Wheatears of all ages undergo a partial winter moult and moult limits, as seen in this bird, can possibly be seen in both adult and second year individuals. However, adults are usually more uniform and fresh in plumage. These details suggest the wheatear was on its first spring migration northwards.

We knew at the time that the Northern Wheatear was rare but research showed it to be a first record for Bhutan (Spierenburg 2005; Rasmussen & Anderton 2012; Damle & Inskipp 2014). Given its long migration routes, vagrants have occurred widely on migration, both in North America and outside its usual routes in Eurasia (Roberson 1980; Cramp 1988). Damle & Inskipp (2014) reviewed all previous published reports from the Indian Subcontinent through 2013, and found about a half-dozen verifiable records for India, based on specimens or photos, and one from Nepal. A review of eBird found two recent spring records from north-eastern India: Arunachal Pradesh (14 March 2014) and Sikkim (30 April 2016). Our Bhutan record is geographically between these locations.

Acknowledgements

We thank our participant Marianne Walsh for providing an additional photo; David Bishop, Björn Malmhagen, and Hans Larsson for discussion of status and ageing; and Rita Carratello and J. Praveen for useful comments on the manuscript.

References

- Bairlein, F., Norris, D. R., Nagel, R., Bulte, M., Voigt, C. C., Fox, J. W., Hussell, D. J. T., & Schmaljohann, H., 2012. Cross-hemisphere migration of a 25 g songbird. *Biology Letters* 8 (4): 505–507.
- Bishop, K. D., 1999. Preliminary notes on some birds in Bhutan. *Forktail* 15 (August): 87–91.
- Cramp, S., (ed.), 1988. *The birds of the Western Palearctic, Volume 5: Tyrant Flycatchers to Thrushes*. London: Oxford University. Pp. 1–1063.
- Damle, S., & Inskipp, T., 2014. Sighting of Northern Wheatear *Oenanthe oenanthe* from the Nubra Valley, Ladakh, Jammu and Kashmir, and a review of previous records from the Indian Subcontinent. *Indian BIRDS* 9 (5&6): 139–141.
- Kren, J., & Zoerb, A. C., 1997. Northern Wheatear (*Oenanthe oenanthe*), version 2.0. In: Poole, A., & Gill, F., (eds). *The Birds of North America*. Ithaca, NY, U.S.A.: Cornell Lab of Ornithology. Website URL: <https://doi.org/10.2173/bna.316>. [Accessed on 01 July 2019.]
- Rasmussen, P. C., & Anderton, J. C., 2012. *Birds of South Asia: the Ripley guide*. 2nd ed. Washington, D.C. and Barcelona: Smithsonian Institution and Lynx Edicions. 2 vols. Pp. 1–378; 1–683.
- Roberson, D., 1980. *Rare birds of the West Coast*. Pacific Grove, CA, U.S.A.: Woodcock Publications. Pp. 1–496.
- Spierenburg, P., 2005. *Birds in Bhutan. Status and distribution*. 1st ed. Bedford, U.K.: Oriental Bird Club. Pp. 1–383.
- Tobgay, T., 2017. First record of Oriental Pratincole *Glaucopis maldivarum* for Bhutan. *BirdingASIA* 27 (June): 120–121.
- David Erterius & Don Roberson
David Erterius, Linerovägen 26 B, SE-224 75 Lund, Sweden.
E-mail: exulanz@yahoo.se [DE]
Don Roberson, 282 Grove Acre Ave., Pacific Grove, CA 93950, U.S.A.
E-mail: creagrus@montereybay.com

Letter to the Editor

Radde's Warbler *Phylloscopus schwarzi* from the Indian Subcontinent—withdrawal of records

Praveen *et al.* (2017) reviewed the sight records for Radde's Warbler *Phylloscopus schwarzi* from Nepal and Bangladesh to assess the evidence for including it in the checklist of the birds of the Indian Subcontinent. The species was accepted into the subcontinental list based upon the two detailed notes of the sight records from Nepal, and multiple individuals recorded in Bangladesh in 1986 for which the context was available. Subsequently, Pamela Rasmussen wrote to Praveen J., about the possibility that those birds were Yellow-streaked Warblers *P. armandi*—a species that could occur in both, Nepal, and Bangladesh, and could look nearly identical, except for its calls. We contacted the observers once more to discuss their notes in this new light. All observers admitted that the Yellow-streaked Warbler was not considered while identifying those birds as Radde's Warblers. The only record for which calls were available was the one from Charali (Nepal) and the observer said that he "... would be surprised (and very disappointed) if I'd identified a bird calling like that as a Radde's back in 1979"; but he agreed that it is "... looking rather thin for a first and is probably best left boxed" (Richard Fairbank, *in litt.*, e-mail dated 15 March 2019). For the Pokhara (Nepal) record, considering the circumstances, the observer felt "... it's best I withdraw the record," (Tony Baker, *in litt.*, e-mail dated 17 March 2019). For the Gulshan (Bangladesh) record, the observer had noted the stubby bill, which is considered diagnostic in literature (vis-à-vis a Yellow-streaked Warbler) but for consistency, was "prepared to withdraw my records" (Bill Harvey, *in litt.*, e-mail dated 29 June 2019).

With a large number of photographers in the region, Radde's—as well as Yellow-streaked Warblers are expected to turn up eventually—until then, we withdraw this species from the list of birds of the Indian Subcontinent.

Reference

- Praveen J., Jayapal, R., Inskipp, T., Warakagoda, D., Thompson, P.M., Anderson, R.C. & Pittie, A., 2017. Birds of the Indian subcontinent: Species not recorded from India. *Indian BIRDS* 13 (4): 93–101.

– Praveen J.
– Tim Inskipp
– Paul M Thompson

Praveen J.,
E-mail: paintedstork@gmail.com
Tim Inskipp, 1 Hernesside, Welney, Wisbech,
Cambridgeshire, PE14 9SB, United Kingdom.
E-mail: tim.inskipp@gmail.com
Paul M. Thompson, House 32 Road 10, Banani,
Dhaka, Bangladesh.
E-mail: paul@agni.com