

The dates of seven new taxa described by W. E. Brooks (*Certhia Hodgsoni*, *Sitta Cashmirensis*, *Dumeticola major*, *Horites [sic] Pallidus*, *Phylloscopus Tytleri*, *Motacilla Cashmirensis*, and *Alauda Guttata*)

Aasheesh Pittie

Pittie, A., 2010. The dates of seven new taxa described by W. E. Brooks (*Certhia Hodgsoni*, *Sitta Cashmirensis*, *Dumeticola major*, *Horites [sic] Pallidus*, *Phylloscopus Tytleri*, *Motacilla Cashmirensis*, and *Alauda Guttata*). *Indian BIRDS* 7 (2): 54–55.
Aasheesh Pittie, P. O. Box # 68, Banjara Hills, Hyderabad 500034, Andhra Pradesh, India. Email: aasheesh.pittie@gmail.com.

In the Nineteenth Century, ornithologists from South Asia used the *Journal of the Asiatic Society of Bengal (JASB)* to publish descriptions of many new bird taxa. The *JASB* was however fraught with problems like financial constraints, and lack of editors, which resulted in delays in publication. Consequently, two dates are sometimes cited for the same description—one, the volume year, and the other, the year in which the *JASB* was actually published, or publication year. Sometimes, papers were read out in the monthly committee meetings of the Society and published as part of the dated minutes in the *JASB*. However, after 1865, the minutes were published separately in the *Proceedings of the Asiatic Society of Bengal* (Mitra 1885). This caused additional confusion, as some taxa seemed to be described as new in both, the *JASB*, and the *Proceedings*.

The ninth paper tabled at the 6 September 1871 meeting of the Asiatic Society of Bengal was by the Civil Engineer (Railways) of Etawah, William Edwin Brooks. It noticed eight avian taxa from ‘Cashmir’ [=Jammu & Kashmir], seven of which were considered

‘new species’ at the time (Brooks 1871; Table 1). Of these, two taxa, namely, *Motacilla Cashmirensis*, and *Alauda Guttata* have since become part of the synonymy of other taxa (Table 2). The remaining five taxa are still in use, but various authorities have recorded their dates of publication inconsistently, over the years—except for that of *Sitta cashmirensis* (Table 1).

At the end of Brooks’s paper was an editorial note stating, “This paper will be published in full in the 1st number of the Natural History Part of the Journal for 1872,” (p. 210). The paper was indeed published in the *Journal* of the Society (Brooks 1872b) in the first issue of Part II¹ of Volume 41, which dates from 1 May 1872, and this has usually been cited in subsequent ornithological works (see Table 2). However, the correct citation for these taxa is from the *Proceedings* (Brooks 1871).

Certhia Hodgsoni, *Sitta Cashmirensis*, *Dumeticola major*, *Horites [sic] pallidus*, and *Phylloscopus Tytleri*, are all valid new names with valid descriptions as published by Brooks (1871), and fulfill the requirements of the Principle of Priority laid down in

Table 1. Taxa described by Brooks (1871), and their year of publication given in various sources
(Correct dating is in bold font)

Author(s)	<i>Certhia Hodgsoni</i>	<i>Sitta Cashmirensis</i>	<i>Dumeticola major</i>	<i>Horites [sic] pallidus</i>	<i>Phylloscopus Tytleri</i>	<i>Motacilla Cashmirensis</i>	<i>Alauda Guttata</i>
Oates 1889 ² , 1890 ³	1872b	1871	1872b	1872b	1872a	1871	1872b
Baker 1922 ⁴ , 1924, 1926, 1930 ⁵	1872b	1871	1872b	1872b	1872a	1871	1872b
Mayr & Greenway 1960	—	—	—	—	—	—	1873 ⁶
Greenway 1967a	—	1871	—	—	—	—	—
Greenway 1967b	1873 ⁷	—	—	—	—	—	—
Ripley 1982	1872b	1871	1871	1872b	1872a	—	1872b
Watson <i>et al.</i> 1986	—	—	1872b	1872b	1872a	—	—
Ali & Ripley 1987	1872b	1871	1871	1872b	1872a	—	1872b
Dickinson <i>et al.</i> 2001	—	—	—	—	—	—	1871
Dickinson 2003	1873 ⁸	1871	1872b	1871	1872a	—	—
Bairlein 2006	—	—	1872b	1871	1872a ⁹	—	—
Harrap 2008b, a	1871 ¹⁰	1871	—	—	—	—	—
Dickinson 2008	1871	—	1871	—	1871	—	—

1 Part II comprised four issues in ‘Natural Science’ published between May and December 1872. The dates of issue of Part I are not known to me. The dates of publication of Part II are printed below the ‘List of contributors,’ after the title page.

2 Oates used an incorrect subsequent spelling: *Sitta kashmirensis* (1: 303).

3 Oates used an incorrect subsequent spelling in the synonymy of *Motacilla personata*: *Motacilla cashmeriensis* (2: 290).

4 Baker used an incorrect subsequent spelling: *Sitta kashmiriensis* (1: 128).

5 Baker used an incorrect subsequent spelling in the synonymy of *Motacilla alba personata*: *Motacilla cashmeriensis* (7: 260).

6 This is an erroneous date for Brooks 1872b.

7 This is an erroneous date for Brooks 1872b.

8 Wrong year. No reference cited.

9 Bairlein does not cite the source publication.

10 del Hoyo *et al.* (2008) quote the wrong reference: “Brooks, W.E. (1871). *J. Asiatic Soc. Bengal* 41 (1872): 74 [*Certhia hodgsoni*]” (p. 799).

Table 2. Recommended citations of taxa described by Brooks (1871)

Citation in Brooks 1871	Current Usage	Source	Recommended citation
<i>Certhia Hodgsoni</i> , p. 209	<i>Certhia familiaris hodgsoni</i>	Harrap 2008b	<i>Certhia familiaris hodgsoni</i> W.E. Brooks, 1871, <i>Proc. Asiatic Soc. Bengal</i> p. 209.
<i>Sitta Cashmirensis</i> , p. 209	<i>Sitta cashmirensis</i>	Harrap 2008a	<i>Sitta cashmirensis</i> W.E. Brooks, 1871, <i>Proc. Asiatic Soc. Bengal</i> p. 209.
<i>Dumeticola major</i> , p. 210	<i>Bradypterus major</i>	Bairlein 2006	<i>Bradypterus major</i> (W.E. Brooks, 1871), <i>Proc. Asiatic Soc. Bengal</i> p. 210.
<i>Horites [sic] Pallidus</i> , p. 210	<i>Cettia fortipes pallida</i>	Bairlein 2006	<i>Cettia fortipes pallida</i> (W.E. Brooks, 1871), <i>Proc. Asiatic Soc. Bengal</i> p. 210.
<i>Phylloscopus Tytleri</i> , p. 210	<i>Phylloscopus tytleri</i>	Bairlein 2006	<i>Phylloscopus tytleri</i> W.E. Brooks, 1871, <i>Proc. Asiatic Soc. Bengal</i> p. 210.
<i>Motacilla Cashmirensis</i> , p. 210	<i>Motacilla alba personata</i>	Sharpe 1885 Baker 1930	<i>Motacilla alba personata</i> Gould, 1861, <i>Birds of Asia</i> , pt. xiii, vol. iv., pl. 63.
<i>Alauda Guttata</i> , p. 210	<i>Alauda gulgula lhamarum</i>	de Juana <i>et al.</i> 2004	<i>Alauda gulgula lhamarum</i> R. Meinertzhagen & A. Meinertzhagen, 1926, <i>Bull. Brit. Orn. Cl.</i> 46: 100.

Article 23 of the International Code of Zoological Nomenclature (ICZN 1999). Therefore they have precedence over Brooks (1872a, b).

It is recommended that future citations follow column 4 in Table 2.

To further learn how *Alauda guttata* was placed in synonymy (Table 2) please see Dickinson *et al.* (2001).

Acknowledgements

I thank E. C. Dickinson for pointing out this anomaly to me, literally putting the facts on my plate, and commenting on earlier drafts; I also thank Dharan, *etc.*, of BNHS library, Bombay, and Amar Bhagat, and Harsh Bajoria in Kolkata for help with publications of the Asiatic Society.

References

- Ali, S., & Ripley, S. D., 1987. *Compact handbook of the birds of India and Pakistan together with those of Bangladesh, Nepal, Bhutan and Sri Lanka*. 2nd ed. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Baker, E. C. S., 1922. *The fauna of British India, including Ceylon and Burma. Birds*. Vol I. 2nd ed. Shipley, A. E. (ed.) London: Taylor and Francis.
- Baker, E. C. S., 1924. *The fauna of British India, including Ceylon and Burma. Birds*. Vol II. 2nd ed. Shipley, A. E. (ed.) London: Taylor and Francis.
- Baker, E. C. S., 1926. *The fauna of British India, including Ceylon and Burma. Birds*. Vol III. 2nd ed. Shipley, A. E. (ed.) London: Taylor and Francis.
- Baker, E. C. S., 1930. *The fauna of British India, including Ceylon and Burma. Birds*. Vol VII. 2nd ed. London: Taylor and Francis.
- Bairlein, F., 2006. Family Sylviidae (Old World warblers). In: *Handbook of the birds of the world. Volume 11. Old World flycatchers to Old World warblers*. Pp. 492–709. del Hoyo, J., Elliott, A., & Christie, D. (eds.). Barcelona: Lynx Edicions.
- Brooks, W. E., 1871. Notes on the ornithology of Cashmir. *Proc. Asiatic Soc. Bengal* 1871 (September): 209–210.
- Brooks, W. E., 1872a. On a new species of *Phylloscopus*. *Ibis* 14 (1): 22–23. [Publ., January 1872.]
- Brooks, W. E., 1872b. Notes on the ornithology of Cashmir. *J. Asiatic Soc. Bengal* XLI (Part II No I): 73–86. [Publ., 1 May 1872.]
- Craig, A. J. F. K., & Feare, C. J., 2009. Family Sturnidae (Starlings). In: *Handbook of the birds of the world. Volume 14. Bush-shrikes to Old World sparrows*. 14: 654–758. del Hoyo, J., Elliott, A., & Christie, D. (eds.). Barcelona: Lynx Edicions.
- de Juana, E., Suárez, F., Ryan, P. G., Alström, P., & Donald, P. F., 2004. Family Alaudidae (Larks). In: *Handbook of the birds of the world. Cotingas to pipits and wagtails*. Pp. 496–601. del Hoyo, J., Elliott, A., & Christie, D. (eds.). Barcelona: Lynx Edicions.
- del Hoyo, J., Elliott, A., & Christie, D., 2008. *Handbook of the birds of the world. Volume 13. Penduline-Tits to Shrikes*. Vol. 13. 1st ed. Barcelona: Lynx Edicions.
- Dickinson, E. C., (ed.) 2003. *The Howard and Moore complete checklist of the birds of the World*. 3rd ed. London: Christopher Helm.
- Dickinson, E. C., 2008. Howard & Moore (2003): Corrigenda 8 (15 October 2008). Pp. 1–87. Unpublished pdf file downloaded on 23 May 2010 at 1314 hrs from: http://science.naturalis.nl/media/133200/hm_corrigenda_8_oct_2008.pdf
- Dickinson, E. C., Dekker, R. W. R. J., Eck, S., & Somadikarta, S., 2001. Systematic notes on Asian birds. 12. Types of the Alaudidae. *Zoologische Verhandlungen, Leiden* 335: 85–126.
- Dickinson, E. C., Loskot, V. M., Morioka, H., Somadikarta, S., & van den Elzen, R., 2006. Systematic notes on Asian birds. 66. Types of the Sittidae and Certhiidae.

Zoologische Mededelingen, Leiden 80-5 (18): 287–310.

- Greenway, J. C., Jr., 1967a. Passeriformes: suborder Oscines, family Sittidae. In: *Check-list of birds of the world. A continuation of the work of James L. Peters*. XII: 125–150. Paynter, R. A., Jr. (ed.) Cambridge, Massachusetts: Museum of Comparative Zoology.
- Greenway, J. C., Jr., 1967b. Passeriformes: suborder Oscines, family Certhiidae. In: *Check-list of birds of the world. A continuation of the work of James L. Peters*. XII: 150–160. Paynter, R. A., Jr. (ed.) Cambridge, Massachusetts: Museum of Comparative Zoology.
- Harrap, S., 2008a. Family Sittidae (Nuthatches). In: *Handbook of the birds of the world. Volume 13. Penduline-tits to Shrikes*. Pp. 102–145. del Hoyo, J., Elliott, A., & Christie, D. (eds.). Barcelona: Lynx Edicions.
- Harrap, S., 2008b. Family Certhiidae (Trecreeperers). In: *Handbook of the birds of the world. Volume 13. Penduline-tits to Shrikes*. Pp. 166–187. del Hoyo, J., Elliott, A., & Christie, D. (eds.). Barcelona: Lynx Edicions.
- ICZN, 1999. *International Code of Zoological Nomenclature*. 4th ed. London: The International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature.
- Mayr, E., & Greenway, J. C., Jr. (eds.). 1960. *Check-list of birds of the world. A continuation of the work of James L. Peters*. Vol IX. 1st ed. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Museum of Comparative Zoology.
- Mitra, R., 1885 (Reprinted 1986). *Centenary Review of the Asiatic Society 1784–1884. Part I. History of the Society*. Reprint ed. Calcutta: The Asiatic Society.
- Oates, E. W., 1889. *The fauna of British India, including Ceylon and Burma (Birds)*. Vol. I. 1st ed. Blanford, W. T. (ed.) London: Taylor and Francis.
- Oates, E. W., 1890. *The Fauna of British India, Including Ceylon and Burma (Birds)*. Vol. II. 1st ed. Blanford, W. T. (ed.) London: Taylor and Francis.
- Ripley, S. D., 1982. *A synopsis of the birds of India and Pakistan together with those of Nepal, Sikkim, Bhutan, Bangladesh and Sri Lanka*. 2nd ed. Bombay; Oxford: Bombay Natural History Society; Oxford University Press.
- Sharpe, R. B., 1885. *Catalogue of the Passeriformes, or Perching Birds, in the collection of the British Museum. Fringilliformes: Part I. Containing the Families Dicaeidae, Hirundinidae, Ampelidae, Mniotiltidae, and Motacillidae*. Vol. X. London: British Museum of Natural History.
- Watson, G. E., Traylor, M. A., Jr., & Mayr, E., 1986. Passeriformes: suborder Oscines, family Sylviidae. In: *Check-list of birds of the world. A continuation of the work of James L. Peters*. XI: 3–294. Mayr, E., & Cottrell, G. W., (eds.). Cambridge, Massachusetts: Museum of Comparative Zoology.

Hume-isms

“So few birds, comparatively speaking, are named after ladies, that one grudges the loss of even one of these delicate tributes of affection, but still I much fear that Maria’s *Pomatorhinus* must disappear into the shadow-realms of synonyms.”

[*Stray Feathers* 5: 136, wherein stating that Blyth’s *P. albogularis* (1855) was similar to Lord Walden’s *P. mariae* (1875).]